



CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL

MEETING MINUTES

August 23, 2018

9:30 AM

Point Reyes National Seashore, Red Barn Classroom, Point Reyes Station, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council for Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS). The council is an advisory body to the sanctuary superintendent. The opinions and findings of this publication do not necessarily reflect the position of CBNMS and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

Call to Order/Roll Call (Kevin Krick)

Kevin Krick, Advisory Council Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:30 AM and welcomed everyone. Lilli Ferguson, advisory council coordinator, then called roll.

Nongovernmental Members Present:

George Clyde (Community-at-Large – Marin County)
Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin County)
Sarah Hameed (Community-at-Large – Sonoma County)
Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large – Sonoma County)
Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Vice-Chair; Education)
Bec Detrich (Education)
Noah Wagner (Fishing)
John Berge (Maritime Activities)
Kevin Krick (Maritime Activities)
Tessa Hill (Research)
Jaime Jahncke (Research)

Agency Members and Alternates Present:

Brian Johnson (Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary [GFNMS] Alt.)
Dayna Matthews (NOAA Fisheries)
LT Darrina Willis (United States Coast Guard [USCG] Alt.)

Members of the CBNMS staff present:

Michael Carver (Deputy Superintendent and Resource Protection Coordinator)
Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist and advisory council coordinator)
Danielle Lipski (Research Coordinator)
Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)

Review and Approve Agenda (Kevin)

The advisory council reviewed the agenda and unanimously approved it.

Review and Approve April Meeting Minutes (Kevin)

The advisory council reviewed and unanimously approved the April 26, 2018 meeting minutes.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report (Michael Carver)

- Michael Carver, the CBNMS Deputy Director and Resource Protection Coordinator, said he was filling in for Sanctuary Superintendent, Dan Howard, who was in Chile, with Todd Jacobs [of Channel Islands National Marine Sanctuary, and others]. They are working with Chileans on management of marine

protected areas (MPAs). Dan was also there two years ago, as some may remember. Later down the line, it is possible there could be a sister sanctuary relationship. We have some marine species in common. Dan will be back in the office on the Monday following the advisory council meeting.

- There have been lots of changes across the system in the Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS), with some changes having a trickle down effect, when higher level positions are not filled. He said John Armor would be taking a detail to fill in as head of the National Ocean Service, with Rebecca Holyoke to backfill for John. There has been an internal call for a staff person to fill in for her. Several national marine sanctuaries have either hired a new Sanctuary Superintendent or are in the process of hiring one. Peter DeCola was hired as Superintendent of Stellwagen Bank National Marine Sanctuary. Those in the process of hiring are Hawaiian Islands and Grays Reef national marine sanctuaries. At Florida Keys National Marine Sanctuary, the person who was the Deputy Director moved to another position within the sanctuary staff, so a replacement will be sought for that position. There have been internal requests for staff members to take details to fill in for various positions [temporarily], and Michael said he had thrown his hat in the ring for some of those. Some vacant positions have been unfilled for a while.

- Stephanie Altman, an attorney with NOAA's Office of General Counsel, is moving to the Foreign Service.

- While the FY 19 budget has not yet been received, it may be level funding or a plus up.

- The staffs of CBNMS and GFNMS are getting together in a few days to talk about plans for 2019 and to continue to build relationships.

- Currently, the Point Reyes lighthouse is closed.

- Regarding the nomination processes for Chumash Heritage, Malloes Bay and Lake Michigan potential new national marine sanctuaries, Michael inquired of the regional directors if there was any new news to report, and there is not. The process for and status of nominations is at <https://nominate.noaa.gov/>; he briefly reviewed the site with the group.

- Michael provided an overview of the Pacific Fisheries Management Council responsibilities for Essential Fish Habitat (EFH), which Dan has reported on previously. He showed some slides Karen Reyna of GFNMS presented to GFNMS Advisory Council, including EFH areas. Danielle Lipski, CBNMS Research Coordinator, clarified the areas shown were proposed and not final. Possibly they could be finalized by spring of 2019. Dayna Matthews added there would be a PFMC meeting next week and that the Fishery Management Councils around the country are pursuing have FMC regulations in place by summer 2019.

- Regarding the Administration's review of national marine sanctuaries, including CBNMS, the Administration has not released any information.

Update on Proposal for Regulation of USCG Discharges in GFNMS and CBNMS (Michael)

- The decision on the USCG discharge matter is in process at headquarters, with documents, including an environmental assessment, in process. There are a number of steps in the federal clearance process, and in this case, two federal agencies are involved. The decision may be made by end of the year, but we have no new news on the release date. The postponement of the existing discharge requirements for USCG activities in the expansion areas of GFNMS and CBNMS runs until December 9, 2018. We hope NOAA's decision will be made before then.

Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation (CMSF) Update (Sarah Hameed)

- Sarah Hameed gave a review of what CMSF is. CMSF recently supported hypoxia monitoring and interns working with CBNMS Education and Outreach coordinator, Jennifer Stock. She asked people to consider donating to CMSF. The foundation supports boat time, staff time, stipends, etc. She showed CMSF hats and stickers.

- George Clyde came on the board recently and energized the board's thinking around fundraising and the community of funders. He put out an email newsletter for past donors about what has been going on in CBNMS; others may be interested in getting on the newsletter list.

- CMSF is working with the Changing Seas film crew, a group that does mini documentaries on exciting ocean places and people who do research on them. The group is doing a film about CBNMS that will talk about sanctuary research, including Bodega Marine Laboratory research within the sanctuary. They will be filming on one of the Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS) cruises and will be interviewing Dan, John Largier, and Tessa Hill at the laboratory. Once done, the film may be shown at events to get people excited about CBNMS. George added that the group, out of Florida, has a good distribution network, including a lot of Public Broadcasting System stations.
- CMSF has created a Facebook page for the first time and is working to build up its social media presence.
- George said the Board would meet in November, and Sarah was nominated, and was likely to be elected, President.
- There is one seat still open for filling on the Board.

NOAA Office of Law Enforcement (OLE) Report (Dayna)

- Dayna provided updates to his previous reports regarding OLE staffing. There is a vacancy from his former alternate, Brian Christy, having moved from Alameda to Hawaii. There may be some recruitment announcements coming out in the fall. The process to recruit for eight previously announced vacancies, including those in Monterey and Long Beach, should be completed next month; then the agency can move forward with other recruitments. The new officer in Monterey would be in place within a month but then would need to do training.
- Special Agent Don Tanner, in Sacramento, is the new NOAA Fisheries alternate to this advisory council. He was unable to be at this meeting due to a family emergency. Don has been with OLE for more than 15 years. Dayna is retiring at the ends of September, and Don will then backfill as the OLE representative on the CBNMS, GFNMS and Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS) advisory councils.
- When a violation goes to the NOAA General Counsel, Enforcement Section, there may be a summary settlement or civil penalty(ies) for sanctuary violations. The violation actions and penalties are listed on the NOAA General Counsel web site. Dayna briefly showed how the site was organized and where to find things on it. Enforcement charging information is issued every six months, and shows what was charged and what was settled.
- For the West Coast, not as many charges and settlements are listing as for other areas. This is partly due to staffing, and because in the region, OLE does not do recreational work; they allow the states to do that. The states get money from a Joint Enforcement Agreement to handle the vast majority of recreational violations, which are filed with the state as crimes.
- Some statutes OLE enforces result in criminal cases, like the Clean Water Act, Endangered Species Act, and the Lacey Act.

Advisory Council Business (Lilli)

- Lilli gave an update on the status of the current round of member recruitment for the advisory council. CBNMS is now in a recruitment round, which ends August 24, 2018; the recruitment is for the Community-at-Large - Sonoma County, Conservation, and Maritime Activities seats. We hope to be able to announce who has been appointed for terms representing those seats and beginning their terms at the November 1 advisory council meeting.
- Bill Wolpert introduced Steve Tubbs, in the audience, and said he is interested in being a Community-at-Large – Sonoma County member; he hoped people would have a chance to talk to Steve. Bill also mentioned another person he hoped may apply as well.
- Lilli explained that with Kevin's term ending, he would go off the advisory council and would no longer serve as the Chair. Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook's term does not end at the same time, so will continue as Vice-Chair. She has agreed to officiate the meetings in this capacity once Kevin's term ends and until the next Chair may be elected. The next CBNMS Advisory Council officer election, for Chair and Vice-Chair, will

be in April 2019, by written ballot per the charter. Nominations will be on the agenda for the February 2019 meeting.

Moving the Climate Conversation toward Community Level Solutions: Overview and Highlights from the National Network for Ocean and Climate Change Interpretation (NNOCCI) Training
(Leslie and Jennifer)

- Jennifer and Leslie introduced themselves, and shared some highlights of the climate and interpretation training they did last year, as part of a study circle.
- Jennifer talked about people's reactions to catastrophic headlines vs. solutions-oriented headlines. The training helped those communicating on this topic to focus on a solutions-oriented, productive mindset. Leslie said a part of the communication was to move people from feeling shut down to feeling they were part of the solution. They explained how and why they communicate about climate in their work.
- NNOCCI's mission is to change the world through better communication techniques around climate change. These communication techniques are based on social research. Research shows zoos, aquaria and parks are trusted sources of science information and are where a lot of people learn about the natural world.
- Strategic framing is a way of presenting things, based on research, to help people understand the mechanisms of climate change and see how they can help work towards solutions. Understanding people's cultural models can help in getting them out of the "swamp" of messages to more productive messages. Elements of strategic framing include using a reasonable tone, leading with human values, and using explanatory metaphors, to make abstract ideas stick. Bringing up values, such as protection or responsible management, helps an audience connect with information being presented.
- Also, communicators can use explanatory metaphors, or simple, short, and memorable ways of conveying concepts, such as describing the atmosphere as a heat trapping blanket for the carbon dioxide that comes from burning fossil fuels. Other metaphors, are that the oceans act like climate's heart, in controlling the circulation of heat and moisture in the climate system, and osteoporosis of the sea, to explain some effects of ocean acidification. Videos showed how people are better able to explain climate concepts after learning the metaphors, than they were before learning them.
- Communications on the topic can also link causes with consequences. When you know up front what consequences people care about, it can help in what explanatory messages and values you use. Finally, some collective local and regional community based solutions can be brought in. Leslie and Jenny provided some local examples, and websites where people can learn more.
- The messages are geared towards adults. The overall topic may not be appropriate to talk about with very young children, but it does work with older children.
- At the January 2016 Sanctuary Advisory Council Summit, chairs and the staff present learned some of these same concepts and messages, and may have subsequently relayed some of the information to their respective advisory councils.
- There was a comment that it helpful to show objective measures of global warming, and it would be helpful to catalog some of these, such as the changes in oysters. For example, hatcheries in Washington need to take ocean acidification into account. The goal would be to try to connect to local places people are trying to protect.
- "Bridge and pivot" are ways of scaling information to a given audience's level of knowledge.
- There was a suggestion for folks to measure their personal emissions at home and in the workplace to inform decisions about things like efficiency.
- A speaker at a Sonoma Environmental Education Collaborative meeting discussed her work about how to communicate climate science. In the North Bay, most accept what is happening. For people who do not, the more data is thrown at them, the more they recoil. Using the short metaphors can help with that. Also, when people do their own energy audits and use the data, it makes it more real for them.

Public Comment

- Sierra Emrick, an intern with Marine Conservation Institute, asked how the public could experience, and learn about, CBNMS.

- Jennifer replied she focuses on bringing the sanctuary to people, since it is an offshore sanctuary. She has done this through exhibits at visitor centers, at the Oakland Museum of California, and through the travelling photo exhibit. She mentioned the outreach she does, including talks, the radio show, professional development with teachers, etc.
- Lilli also mentioned the CBNMS web site describes CBNMS and how it is managed.

CBNMS Education and Outreach, Research, and Resource Protection Program Report (Jennifer, Danielle, and Michael)

Research: Danielle reported there had been two ACCESS cruises since the last meeting, with another one coming up in September. A lot of whales have been observed. For the September cruise, John Amor, funders, and media will be participating. CBNMS advisory council members who wish to observe one day (date to be determined) can email her with their interest.

- The hypoxia moorings are deployed, year round. An intern, Kate Hewitt, who also was recently named Nancy Foster Scholar, was responsible for the most recent round of deployments, using our boat.
- The first round of acoustic mooring data is now being analyzed by a Nancy Foster Scholar, Samara Haver, who is working on the project for her Ph.D. The CBNMS data was complete and, in early stages of analysis, she could see some signals of whales arriving and departing. There will be more to report later as the analysis progresses.
- Carina Fish was also recently named a Nancy Foster Scholar. The Nancy Foster Scholar program is through ONMS. It is a national, competitive program, and provides stipends for student tuition. It is important to have student who want to work on sanctuary projects and work with us. Scholars benefit sanctuaries and the program benefits them.
- They got ship time on the NOAA ship *Bell M. Shimada* for benthic habitat characterization, including of deep sea corals, and EFH and Rockfish Conservation Area assessment. She mentioned the various partners/funders involved in this project. They did some remotely operated vehicle (ROV) surveys, side scan surveys, collected some specimens, and did multibeam mapping.
- Dani described and showed graphics of existing RCA and EFH areas, and proposals for reopening and closing areas, with respect to CBNMS.
- Dayna noted RCAs are meant to be reopened once the stocks are rebuilt. EFH may be in proximity with RCAs, and is established for habitat reasons.
- Dani said they previously had little data between the Bank and deeper slopes, so wanted to focus this work on those areas as well as get back to other areas. She described the areas surveyed, and noted that they did not get to the northern area of GFNMS, but did get to northern MBNMS. Mapping in CBNMS included the area at the head of Bodega Canyon; a long transect was done in EFH area; one was done in a RCA; and one was done on the Bank. The EFH area has soft habitat with sea stars, brittle stars, sea pens and urchins as well as octopus, flatfish, ling cod, crab and more. In the RCA area, they saw big schools of hake and krill as well as urchins, fish, octopus, flatfish, skates and more. On the western slope off the Bank, they saw octopus, soft corals, mushroom corals, flatfish, sponges, crinoids, rockfish, red sea fans, brachiopods, and marine debris (seen everywhere). There were no bamboo or black corals. The Northern transect on the Bank has big boulder habitat; invertebrates are more sparse there, but there are yellow gorgonians. They also did another transect nearby that has some of the more familiar habitat and species people associate with Cordell Bank.
- She concluded with highlights of what was accomplished.
- In next steps, the ONMS West Coast Region folks working on benthic habitat will continue this work at the federal agency level on with the Bureau of Ocean Energy Management, the U.S. Geological Survey, etc. on getting resources to support expanding Pacific research (called the EXPRESS campaign).
- The next cruise in CBNMS, by NMFS folks, she was able to suggest sites for them to go to (if weathered out of sites in GFNMS and MBNMS).
- Analysis of 2017 ROV data is still underway. She will report on that when it is done.

- NOAA Deep Sea Coral Research and Technology Program funding moves around regionally. We are a part of, and engaged in, work that will occur in the West Coast in 2019, and hope some of those funds will help in accomplishing some of the CBNMS benthic characterization priorities in the next few years.

Resource Protection: Michael described the recent awards ceremony held for all the ship companies that slowed down to ten knots or less as part of the voluntary vessel speed reduction initiative for the San Francisco Traffic Separation Scheme. He showed a sample award plaque. The initiative matters for clearer air, safer whales and quieter oceans. One of the silent partners at the event was the California Air Resource Board for this area, who has given funds to help spur reducing emissions; next year, the plan is to give plaques and checks to companies, with awards in different levels.

- Michael hoped that, in a year, more companies would be voluntarily slowing their vessels in cooperation with this effort.

- He mentioned the funding sources for the program, and how the funding was used.

- He thanked a number of folks for their participation in organizing the awards ceremony and/or participating in the effort.

- Lilli reviewed the four permits and Letter of Authorization under the Superintendent's permit issued since this last advisory council meeting.

- Michael reviewed that the West Coast Region had an in-person Resource Protection Coordinators meeting; they get together once a year. Paige Doelling, acting national Resource Protection Coordinator, was also there, along with regional staff. They talked about accomplishments, plans and next steps related to resource protection topics.

Education and Outreach: Jennifer said on project she had been working on was upgrades, including new panels and video, for the Point Reyes National Seashore Bear Valley Visitor Center.

- The Point Reyes Lighthouse area will be renovated and upgraded, with Americans with Disabilities Act accessibility and updated park information being among the things to be addressed. This is why the lighthouse area, including the Ocean Exploration Center, is closed now. People can check the Point Reyes National Seashore website for the project status.

- The August 4 Get Into Your Sanctuary Day film event in Point Arena, in partnership with the Arena Theatre and San Francisco International Film Festival, saw about 60 in attendance.

- The travelling CBNMS photo exhibit is still moving around; it is in Oakland now at the Rockridge Library and will move this fall, to two cafes in Berkeley, and the Sausalito Library.

- There was a question regarding if copies of photos from the exhibit could be sold. Jennifer replied [it was possible] that we could, but we do not sell them. She noted some of the images that are in the public domain could be sold, but others, taken by divers from Bay Area Underwater Explorers or volunteers could not be sold. She was unsure also of the moneymaking potential of embarking on selling images from the show.

- Environmental literacy has been an ongoing theme in Jennifer's career. Some educators do not have good knowledge about their local ocean. NOAA and ONMS are trying to engage environmental education leaders and teachers, from grades K-12.

- She talked about the grant to connect Next Generation Science Standards Marin's bay and ocean backyard, and the partnership for this project. She got just started with planning for the year. She is aiming for 27 teachers in grades 6-12; a driving question will be how to include the study of climate change in the curriculum, as it relates to the county's coastal ecosystem. There will be field experiences.

- Next year, 2019, is the 30th anniversary of CBNMS. It will be an opportunity to celebrate what we have done, what has been learned, how people have gotten engaged, etc. She would love to hear ideas.

Members' and Alternates' Reports (advisory council)

Leslie – noted the Point Reyes National Seashore Association had a new Executive Director, Donna Faure. There will be a Drakes Beach Coastal Cleanup Day event in about three weeks, from 11 AM – 2

PM. This Saturday there will be sand sculpture contest. The ten year anniversary of the Giacomini Wetlands restoration is September 27, and will be celebrated with hikes and presentations.

Jaime Jahncke – reviewed work done by Point Blue Conservation Science during recent cruises, looking at birds, whales, the behavior of plankton, etc. In July, they did an ACCESS-like cruise to Davidson Seamount in MBNMS, on the NOAA *Ship Bell M. Shimada*, looking at where whales aggregated and their distribution. The data from the cruises will be processed over the next few months. Point Blue just completed work for the sanctuary staff on vessel speed reduction, to figure out how many whales were saved and come up with targets based on different speed slowdowns. Highlights may be presented at the next meeting.

Tessa Hill – mentioned there would be a Global Climate Action Summit in September 12-14. She read from website. This week they released an ocean plan, globally focused. People may participate remotely and there are public events. She thanked people who reached out to her after Susan Williams' death. There will be a celebration of her life at UC Davis on October 26, with another event at the Bodega Marine Laboratory on October 27.

Mike Cummings – California Senate Bill 834 is proposed to prevent developing oil and gas reserves in federal waters by prohibiting building new infrastructure California-managed tidelands and submerged lands. People can call their Senator to voice their opinions.

Bec Detrich – Westminster Woods serves approximately 7-8,000 kids and 250 teachers. This year they are launching Winged Ambassadors as one of the evening program choices, when kids come for 3-5 day residential programs. All programs are in support of the Next Generation Science Standards. They hope to include the biomimicry program as part of embedded curriculum, year after year.

Noah Wagner - fishermen are doing well at catching salmon. The sport guys are catching some decent-sized fish; the commercial guys are getting small fish. There is some halibut fishing. Albacore are starting to show up outside the coast. There are lots of whale sightings this year. There was a boat grounding; the *Miss Anita* had to run ashore at Salmon Creek beach to avoid putting people in the water. Everyone got off safely, but the boat was a complete loss. It broke up into pieces, but was cleaned up within a day or two. Proposals are being accepted by anyone who wants to run a fishing-related business on the dock; the fish dock will be coming up at the end of year and there will be competition for bringing in a new fish buyer. The Bodega Seafood Art and Wine Festival is August 25-26.

George – remarked it was a good sign that the salmon were small, due to the growth cycle. He enjoyed the presentations today, and congratulated Kevin and all for making it a worthwhile day.

LT Darrina Willis – formally introduced herself. She is the USCG alternate for CDR Jason Brand for the next year. They represent the USCG at all the national marine sanctuaries in California, so will be alternating who attends and balancing other demands as well. Sector San Francisco will be conducting whale watching community outreach, educating on safety around whales, participating with recreational boaters, and generally sharing knowledge to keep individuals and whales safe.

Brian Johnson – noted most of his announcements were already covered by the CBNMS staff. There is a new story map for GFNMS, with points of interest along the shoreline, on the GFNMS web site. Also, they are doing Sharktober Fest again on September 29.

Sarah – The State of California has begun evaluated its whole network of state MPAs. A community of folks will be involved. She asked if any of the national marine sanctuaries in California would be forwarded for the green list. Michael was not sure; CBNMS is located entirely in federal waters. NOAA

did nominate the central coast national marine sanctuaries [as part of the California Current Conservation Complex] to be on the World Heritage List. Sonoma Coast Surfrider Foundation is organizing a blue water paddle race at Doran Beach in October. Coastal cleanups will be happening at various Sonoma coast beaches on September 15.

Bill – the Global Climate Action Summit is just one activity occurring in September in San Francisco. There will be film festivals, exhibits at galleries, lectures, and a march – all related to reducing carbon and to sustainability. He is going to an all-day lecture on carbon smart building, for zero net energy buildings. Has been involved in three rebuilds since the fires last year, that involve collaborations with the Sonoma County Water Agency, Sonoma Clean Power, and PG&E, for rebuilding houses above building code minimums. The campaign season has started; he is not running, but there are a lot of important issues on ballots. He encouraged people to exercise their votes.

Kevin – talked about the .50 % global sulfur cap in fuel oil used in ships to take effect January 1, 2020 and a greenhouse gas initiative, both put forward by the International Maritime Organization (IMO). The sulfur cap causes concerns over future fuel availability for ships. The USCG will be the agency to approve scrubbers for ships and alternative to changing from existing fuel. Steamships will go away in 2020. Matson has/will have four new ships, which will be Liquefied Natural Gas capable, replacing seven Matson steamships. On the greenhouse gas side, the IMO is putting together a ship fuel oil consumption database. CARB has not had any fines related to the ships plugging into dock power. The State Lands Commission released a study on the feasibility of shore-based treatment of ballast water; since long ago, companies went with shipboard treatment, the study said there is not much feasibility of putting the facilities on shore. About a half dozen treatment systems have been approved in the U.S. to meet the stringent international standard, but California's standard is 1,000 times better than that, and it is not feasible to meet it now. The legislature will need to revisit the issue. Kevin is on the Smithsonian Environmental Research Center (SERC) board, which will soon review SERC's strategic and science plans. He recommended people read "Getting to Green", which discusses what is needed to make progress on greenhouse gas discussions; SERC will be delivering some of these messages. Kevin mentioned this was his last full meeting. He will opening the November meeting, and will say more then. His term is ending. Leslie will run the rest of that meeting. The retreat is coming up, in October.

Kevin adjourned the meeting at 2:21 PM.