



**CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY
SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL**

MEETING MINUTES

November 5, 2015

9:15 AM

Point Blue Conservation Science, Petaluma, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council for Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS). The council is an advisory body to the sanctuary superintendent. The opinions and findings of this publication do not necessarily reflect the position of CBNMS and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

Call to Order/Roll Call/Welcome (George Clyde)

George Clyde, Advisory Council Chair, called the meeting to order at 9:32 AM and welcomed everyone. Lilli Ferguson, advisory council coordinator, then called roll. Bob Van Syoc introduced himself as the new Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation (CMSF) President and is giving a report later in the agenda. Rebecca Detrich, another guest, introduced herself as the Education Director at Westminster Woods. She previously worked with Jennifer Stock (CBNMS Education and Outreach Coordinator) and is excited to share the work of CBNMS and the advisory council with other educators.

Members and Alternates Present:

George Clyde (Chair; Community-at-Large – Marin County)

Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin County Alt.)

Sarah Hameed (Community-at-Large – Sonoma County Alt.)

Todd Steiner (Conservation Alt.)

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Education)

Rachel Bergren (Education Alt.)

Richard Ogg (Fishing)

Noah Wagner (Fishing Alt.)

Kevin Krick (Maritime Activities)

John Berge (Maritime Activities Alt.)

Jaime Jahncke (Research)

Agency Representatives and Alternates Present:

None

Members of the CBNMS staff were also present:

Dan Howard (Sanctuary Superintendent)

Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist and advisory council coordinator)

Dani Lipski (Research Coordinator)

Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)

Review and Approve Agenda (George)

The agenda was reviewed and unanimously approved by the advisory council with the addition of Sarah Seiter as another speaker for the agenda item on Cordell Bank at the Oakland Museum of California (OMCA).

Review and Approve August Meeting Minutes (George)

The August 20, 2015 meeting minutes were reviewed and unanimously approved by the advisory council.

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report (Dan)

- Sanctuary Superintendent Dan Howard said NOAA has committed to moving through the national marine sanctuary designation process for proposed sanctuaries in Wisconsin, in Lake Michigan; in Maryland, in Mallows Bay. If designated, the sites would preserve maritime heritage and natural resources. A proposal for adding a Chumash Heritage site in southern California to the site nomination list has been submitted for review.
- There is no new news about Dan Basta, who remains on administrative leave, with John Armor still acting as the Director.
- Congress passed the FY 16 budget. The budget for Office of National Marine Sanctuaries (ONMS) is about the same as last year, approximately \$48 million. CBNMS submitted its budget request. Funding for the Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS), for both work in CBNMS and Greater Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS) was included in the base request. Restoration of funding for a half time research assistant was requested. An education specialist, to work in the coastal and inland areas next to the expanded areas of CBNMS and GFNMS was requested. One-time funding for studying coral (70 m and shallower) invertebrates and fish (70-90 m) by Remotely Operated Vehicle (ROV) was also included in the budget request. - Bluefin tuna has been added to the list of species observed in CBNMS.
- The following were reappointed to new terms on the advisory council: Lance Morgan, Conservation seat, member; Todd Steiner, Conservation seat, alternate; Bill Wolpert, Community-At-Large – Sonoma County seat, member; Sarah Hameed, Community-At-Large - Sonoma County seat, alternate; Kevin Krick, Maritime Activities seat, member; and John Berge, Maritime Activities seat, alternate.
- In August, NOAA published a notice in the Federal Register about Special Use Permit Fees (SUP); comments were accepted until October 6. CBNMS has never issued a SUP. A final notice about the fees will come out in the Federal Register soon. SUPs may be issued for the placement and recovery of objects on the seabed related to public or private events, or commercial filming; the continued presence of commercial submarine cables; the disposal of cremated human remains; recreational diving near the USS Monitor; the deployment of fireworks displays; or the operation of aircraft below the minimum altitude in restricted zones of national marine sanctuaries.
- A permit for drone use would be needed in sanctuary areas covered by low overflight restrictions. No fee can be charged for regular permit processing and administration. SUP fees can go back into monitoring or other work related to the activity covered by the SUP.
- Conversations with the U.S. Coast Guard are continuing regarding their request to exempt discharges in the CBNMS and GFNMS regulations. There will be an extension of the current

exemption. The staff is asking questions and gathering data related to untreated sewage and graywater from vessels, and small arms and search and rescue training discharges.

- Lilli is assuming the role of permit coordinator and has been getting up to speed on the functions.

- For the Resource Protection Report [Michael Carver was unable to attend the meeting], Michael assisted with a recent GFNMS ROV cruise studying maritime heritage resources; the derelict crab gear recovery project is underway; and Michael presented on the shipping lane changes and affected groups at the University of Rhode Island, at a marine spatial planning workshop. Also, the seasonal voluntary vessel slowdown in the San Francisco shipping lanes will end for the year November 15. Michael has been working a variety of people, from GFNMS, USCG, and the National Marine Fisheries Service on various elements of the ship strikes of whales issue, and they will be looking at speed limits in the shipping lanes. The shipping industry was informed prior to the voluntary slowdown beginning, and there was a comment it would be good to inform them it has ended.

CBNMS Research and Education Reports (Danielle Lipski and Jennifer Stock)

- Research: Danielle Lipski, CBNMS Research Coordinator, gave a short update on the fieldwork since August. The September 18-27 Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS) cruise was completed. They observed pelagic red crabs, small krill, and less gelatinous zooplankton in the tucker trawl. Also observed common dolphins on transects and documented an absence of Pacific white-sided dolphins which are normally present. Two lines in the north part of GFNMS were sampled. In the middle of the trip, NOAA divers from Monterey dove off the Fulmar and stayed overnight on the boat in Point Arena. Some reporters covered the cruise, resulting in good print and TV news stories. Mike Cummings joined the cruise for one day. Advisory council members who are interested in going on a cruise in the future can talk to Dani; September can be a good time.

- CBNMS now has an acoustic buoy deployed that is part of the NOAA Ocean Noise Reference Station Network, which includes 11 stations around the country. They are all designed and calibrated the same way so data can be compared across stations and over time. In CBNMS, we want understand the sanctuary soundscape, be able to characterize it, and compare it to other areas. The buoy will record sounds from 10-2,200 hz, and will pick up whale and vessel sounds. Baleen whales generate a wide frequency of sound and frequencies overlap with shipping noise. Some other mammals make higher frequency noise and the station may not be able to pick that up. Blue whales, in quiet scenarios, can be heard over a distance of a hundred km. The press was out for the buoy deployment; one story already came out in the Press Democrat and another story from NPR will come out soon. When the buoy is retrieved in two years, the Pacific Marine Environmental Laboratory will do a standard analysis of the data and a graduate student will conduct additional data analysis.

- The dissolved oxygen moorings are still out in CBNMS, and have been since May. Dani hopes to pick them up this month.

- She is close to getting out a report and data from the Remotely Operated Vehicle (ROV) survey in the expansion area in 2014, including parts of Bodega Canyon and the “football.” The report will be published online, and once published, she will share it. Kaitlin Graiff hopes to have the analysis of the Cordell Bank ROV data out this winter.

- James Seward, a CBNMS intern this past summer, created a story map about using an ROV on Cordell Bank. The story map is posted on both the CBNMS and CMSF websites.

- The Bay Area Underwater Explorers (BAUE) provided photos and videos of their 2014 trip to Cordell Bank to the CBNMS staff, for use in education and outreach. The group cancelled their planned October 2015 trip; the weather window was too short for them to do the trip safely.

- Education Report: Jennifer Stock reported that next year is the 10th year of the Ocean Currents radio show on KWMR. The station is rebroadcasting some of the shows from 5 to 5:30 PM.

- CBNMS applied for an Every Kid in a Park grant, which, if received, would be implemented with Sonoma County Regional Parks, to bring 4th graders to visit Doran Beach, where they would do some marine ecology.

- She had been working with GFNMS educators to find out what other organizations are doing, and how to work together now that the sanctuaries expanded. She has some meetings planned about this.

- The Point Reyes Lighthouse ocean visitor center is nearly done. Panels for the center are being designed with funds from CMSF Panel themes include open ocean, rocky reef, and deep sea (which includes a whale fall). There are also models of a white shark, sea lion, shearwater, Dall's porpoise and a rocky reef. When the center is closed, people will be able to look in through the windows to see the exhibits. There will also be a panel outside. This will be a great place to hang out when weather is bad. A center opening will be planned when work is completed. The park staff will get a kit of interpretive messages for the public. She is working on a plan to do more interpretation there, and will be training the docents.

Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation (CMSF) Update (Tom Lambert and Bob)

- Tom Lambert introduced Bob, who became President of CMSF in October.

- Bob first heard about Cordell Bank when Bob Schmieder came to the California Academy of Sciences to talk to the curators about what they were seeing at the bank. He met Dan Howard in the early 1980s, when he worked at the National Marine Fisheries Service laboratory in Tiburon. He caught brown rockfish with two former advisory council members. When the Academy archived some additional photos and voucher specimens from Cordell Bank, he reconnected with Dan and Bob Schmieder. He plans to put a link on the CMSF website to some of those photos.

- Bob noted he has been on the board about four years. He wants CMSF to collaborate with the staff, the advisory council, and the general community; if anyone knows someone who wants to fund projects, he suggested directing them to the CMSF website or to give them his email address.

- It is a small foundation with very low overhead. Almost all money donated to CMSF goes directly to projects. Most administrative costs are donated by the board members, who are all volunteers.

- The board would like to expand CMSF public outreach via the Foundation website and social media. Also, Bob wants to explore funding mini grants for research within CBNMS, such as for student and post doc projects, student internships, and cost-sharing on the Fulmar.

- Advisory council members are welcome to come to the meetings of the CMSF board.

Cordell Bank at the Oakland Museum of California (OMCA) (Amy Billstrom and Sarah Seiter)

- Jenny introduced Amy Billstrom and Sarah Seiter; Amy is the Associate Director, Learning Initiatives, and Sarah is the Associate Curator, Natural Sciences, at OMCA. The CBNMS

relationship with OMCA started about ten years ago, when NOAA provided funding for bringing a Cordell Bank exhibit to the museum, which has now been built.

- Amy and Sarah provided an overview of OCMA (opened in 1969), its mission statement, the populations it serves, and its physical construction. It has gardens which are free, public open space. The museum staff is particularly interested in serving the neighborhoods closest to the museum, better serving traditionally underserved people, and knowing the community better.
- OMCA has a gallery of California art, a gallery of California history, and a gallery of California Natural Sciences.
- The Natural Sciences gallery was renovated and reopened in 2013, with a more dynamic, interactive focus. NOAA was part of the gallery re-installation. The gallery presents seven places throughout California that depict the state's natural diversity. The Cordell Bank exhibit has models, art made of marine debris, dioramas, and a theater area.
- OMCA did evaluations of the gallery, and they reviewed some of the results from the Garibay Group study, which researched, "What role does sense of place play in visitors' experiences with habitat dioramas?" and the Serrell & Associates study, which gathered basic visitor data and researched, "What types of experiences do each of the exhibits invoke for visitors?"
- One aspect was to measure how people used dioramas when visiting the galleries, and if a diorama helped connect them to the place being featured. The results showed place does matter, and knowing a place allows people to connect with it in a different way. The Cordell Bank exhibit has a reef diorama and an elephant seal diorama, which people enjoy seeing.
- On visitor data, they learned people with a special interest in the gallery stay about ten minutes longer on average than other visitors, and that a number of families visit the gallery.
- The studies provided insight into what people recalled about the gallery, their sensory experiences, and new perspectives they gained.
- OMCA is using the galleries to develop its audience, and increase visitation. About 140,000 people a year visit now. Their goal is to bring people in, then bring them to a closer, more loyal relationship with the museum. The museum is open until 9 PM each Friday, and outside on those nights there is a DJ, band, and food trucks. On those nights they have a bar in the café, tours, family programs, and other special activities. Attendance went up in the past two years and attendance numbers continue to do well in 2015.
- They feature pop-up talks in the gallery; Bob Schmieder did a talk in front of the bathymetric map in the Cordell Bank section.
- An educational program they do is called "Under the Sea: The Amazing World of Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary."
- Amy and Sarah also provided an overview of other OCMA programs, the use of docents, interactive activities, an innovation lab, etc.
- In terms of what is next, they want to expand exposure of and experience with CBNMS through programming, such as more pop-up talks and family programs in April/May 2016. They are looking for speakers to address their docents, and people who can do pop-up talks. They are also working with CBNMS on an Earth Day mini film festival in 2016. Additional partnerships with CBNMS may arise through continued conversations.

Advisory Council Business (Lilli)

Lilli announced the dates and locations for the CBNMS Advisory Council 2016 meetings and retreats: February 25, 2016, Petaluma; April 20, Bodega Bay [tentatively] planned to be a joint

meeting with the GFNMS Advisory Council); August 25, Point Reyes Station; and November 3, Petaluma. The retreat is planned for October 6, in Marshall.

Members' and Alternates' Reports (advisory council)

Kevin: he is now with Matson, a U.S. flag company. The company also has a person on the ONMS Business Advisory Council. He described the various places Matson ships go. He is now more operationally integrated in his job than previously, and has been doing vessel audits. This could help if anyone has an operational question.

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook: The Point Reyes National Seashore Association (PRNSA) is going through a tough time with some staff losses, including the Field Institute director, the Field Institute coordinator, and the director of the education center. Recently, they hired a new bookstore manager and filled the Field Institute director position. PRNSA will do some restructuring. They raised some money from the Dinner on the Pacific Plate. They are going to be working from some 4th grade schools, including from the East Bay, and are trying to target some new schools for inclusion.

Mike: He was very interested to see how everyone worked on their various tasks during the ACCESS cruise he went on, and he recommended people go if they get the chance. It was a wonderful day. Dani added she will let the advisory council know of ACCESS opportunities next year, and recommended people who were interested sign up for a specific date, then reevaluate closer to that date if they want to go or not. Some days, the vessel does not go out due to rough weather.

Dick Ogg: The domoic acid problem is really detrimental to the commercial crab fishery; there is an indefinite delay, and they are doing regular tests to see if the domoic acid is decreasing or not. It appears to be increasing along the coastline and no one knows how long it will last. The crews need the money. He also said he was working with Jen Renzullo of the SeaDoc Society on derelict crab gear removal. He will be going out in a few days to remove gear from along shorelines, from south of Fish Rocks to Drake's Bay. The majority of pots in the 20-30 fathom range are picked up by fishermen. During the season, ocean conditions and kelp can move the pots and many times they don't recover the gear – 10% loss is considered a good deal. Pots cost about \$150 and have to be put together. The crab pot recovery program is really important, and he is trying to get the rest of the guys interested in it. Fishermen are paid for the pots they bring in, and Noah Wagner offered a place to keep the pots in so they were secure. The grant money came from the NOAA Marine Debris Program. Fishermen tend to not want to get involved in the project unless they have nothing else to do. The program pays for the pots brought in, not the time spent looking. There is also someone in San Francisco who is supposed to pick up gear, and he will go to some spots near the shipping channels. There is so much current there, often the pots get covered with silt and they cannot get them up. Todd added that a leatherback turtle was recently found tangled in a net. Jaime Jahncke noted ACCESS collects location data on crab pots after season closes. This information should go to Jen, Dick advised, though he said he could also pass it on to fishermen.

Sarah Hameed: She mentioned toxic algae in the Russian River around the 4th of July led to the death of a dog that had been swimming in the river. The authorities did not close to river to

swimming. The “Gateway” effort has been generating some angst due to the lack of inclusion in the planning process up until now, but planning meetings are coming up. There has been discussion in the community about several topics: the effect of rules on coastal development, tourism, agriculture, traffic, drunk driving, and a proposed tasting room near Spud Point. Dan said he had a tour of the site and heard it would be promoting kayaking, getting in the water, etc. Noah added the site proposal had been scaled back, and traffic and parking seemed to be the main issues with it. Two tasting rooms opened recently. Dan noted there were many coastal communities interested in partnering with national marine sanctuaries and having visitor centers. At some point in time, the plan is to have a working group make a strategic recommendation on how sanctuary managers should move forward on the coast with a focus on a visitor center. George commented he had been debating development vs. preserving culture in Marin for seven years, and things have come to a good point now. The Local Coastal Program will be a California Coastal Commission (CCC) agenda item (for the 2nd or 3rd time) sometime in the next year; it was previously rejected by the CCC, he said. Sarah then announced Athena McGuire, a phenomenal underwater photographer, is now doing graduate work with Karina Nielsen’s lab, and that she has a photography exhibit at Café Del Sol in San Rafael. Finally, Bodega Marine Laboratory’s 50th anniversary celebration is in 2016, and there will be a big open house in September.

Jaime: ACCESS results will be presented at three of four conferences in the upcoming year, and he reviewed the conferences and the result topics to be presented. Birds did well this year: Cassin’s auklets had an about average breeding season, and common murres had a slightly below average breeding season. Next year they expect to see a late start of the breeding season and larger impact from El Niño. On the islands now are 27 brown boobies and one blue footed booby on the islands now; also there are balls of baitfish that attract seabirds and these are being spotted daily around the Farallones. The common murre die-off was unusual this year; over 1,000 birds were collected in the San Francisco Bay Area, which is about five times greater than usual. The reason for die-off is not truly known. A speculation is they have a larger breeding population, and chicks and adults that molt cannot move to different locations to search for food. There is a lot of food for whale aggregations, but it may be too deep for the birds to access.

Todd: He reported there was a lot of pressure in California to phase out the drift gillnet fishery, and that there is a proposal to close it down after it has reached a certain point. The issue has gone from Washington and Oregon to here. Tomales Bay is considered an impaired water body, and new septic rules will kick in, as new development will be required to be set back farther from an impaired waterway. His organization is now training teachers as part of the Bay Watershed Education and Training (B-WET) program. Also, they will soon start creek walks to see salmon. Some have already been seen.

George: He and Bill visited Flower Garden Banks National Marine Sanctuary and dove it for a weekend. The invitation came out of the most recent Sanctuary Advisory Council Summit. It is an entirely offshore sanctuary, and the diving is deep diving. The sanctuary is mixed in with oil rigs, but those have limited impact on the coral heads, which have been stable as long as they have been monitored (over 20 years). They also dove on a non-active oil rig. The rigs attract fish and predators, and a number of things grow on the rigs. He will do it again next year. For the GFNMS Advisory Council, he is heading up a new working group looking at the overflight

zones. They are examining the possibility of extending or adding to those along the Sonoma coast, and possibly in in Tomales Bay and some rocks off the bay. They may look at Drake's Bay and Drake's Estero (which is not in the sanctuary). In Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (MBNMS), they may look at Devil's Slide Rock, which is by the Half Moon Bay Airport; this part of MBNMS is managed by the GFNMS staff. Jaime is also on the working group. The working group hopes to make a recommendation to the GFNMS Advisory Council in November 2016. The National Park service does not have overflight regulations over any of its parks. There is pilot resistance, and several people from Half Moon Bay are on the working group. The GFNMS overflight regulations apply to any motorized aircraft, including drones. Local stakeholder groups will be invited to give input. John Berge added the governor recently signed a bill regarding paparazzi not flying over people's houses to take photographs; other clauses had been proposed, but the bill was amended at the end. Jaime showed a video taken for research purposes by a drone over a bird colony in Peru, in which the birds did not appear to be disturbed.

George adjourned the meeting at 1:52 PM.